



**Vipac Engineers and Scientists Limited**

279 Normanby Rd, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Private Bag 16, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

t. +61 3 9647 9700 | f. +61 3 9646 4370 | e. melbourne@vipac.com.au

w. www.vipac.com.au | A.B.N. 33 005 453 627 | A.C.N. 005 453 627

City of Yarra  
333 Bridge Road  
Richmond, 3121,

10/12/2020

Ref: 30N-20-0144-GCO-6783560-1

**Attention: Nish Goonetilleke**

Dear Nish,

25 Balmain Street, 128 - 134 Cubitt Street & Laneway - Peer Review

This peer review of MEL Consultants "Desktop Environmental Wind Assessment" (Report: 47-20-DE-EWA-00 Rev2) is based on Vipac's experience as a wind engineer consultancy. No wind tunnel studies have been undertaken to support this review.

Vipac has reviewed the desktop Environmental Wind Assessment and the relevant drawings (refer to drawing list in attachment) and has the following comments:

- i. The MEL Consultants Environmental Wind Assessment has been prepared base on consultancy experience and no wind tunnel testing has been carried out to support their assessment. We have no issues with this method for a desktop study as this is a common approach to provide architects, developments and responsible authorities advice on the wind impact of the proposed design.
- ii. We have no issues with the analysis approach, wind environment and exposure estimate. MEL Consultants have clearly described the process for the desktop assessment and this is consistent with the approach that Vipac would take. A clear description of the proposed development has provided along with the set of drawings provided by JCB Architects dated 18<sup>th</sup> June 2019.
- iii. The report has used the assessment criteria for Melbourne areas developed by MEL Consultants. Vipac has no issues with this, and believes that the criteria are in line and comparable with the council and DELWP guidelines.
- iv. The report analysed the wind effects of the four building facades on the streetscapes along Balmain Street, Cubitt Street and the small access road to the west. It concluded that the wind levels are expected to meet the recommended walking comfort criterion in the pedestrian pathways and stationary comfort criteria in the primary entrance and entries to the proposed tenancies. Vipac agrees with this conclusion.
- v. The report assessed the expected wind conditions at the communal terraces proposed at various levels within the development. The terraces on Levels 1-4 were expected to generally achieve the stationary activities criterion, except near the building corners which would achieve the recommended walking comfort criterion. The communal terrace of Level 5 would be expected to meet the walking comfort criterion, except at the far northern end of the terrace. The report recommends incorporating higher balustrade or screen or dense landscaping along the northern edge. Vipac agrees the recommendations.

10/12/2020

In conclusion, the MEL Consultants Environment Wind Assessment report used the proper analysis and methodology to analyse the wind effects on the pedestrian level surrounding the proposed development in detail, as well as the terraces throughout the development. The report found that the proposed design would be expected to have an acceptable wind environment within the recommended wind comfort criteria at the ground level. For the Level 5 terrace, the report recommends higher balustrades or dens landscaping be incorporated on the northern perimeter of the terrace.

Vipac agrees with the conclusion of no wind tunnel testing would be required for this development.

Yours sincerely,

**Vipac Engineers & Scientists Ltd**







Sophie Lamande  
**Wind Group Leader**



Dr. Zhuyun Xu  
**Senior Wind Engineer**

## ATTACHMENT

*Documents reviewed:*

Name	Date modified
 Landscape Plans	3/07/2020 4:16 PM
 Plans(2)	3/07/2020 4:16 PM
 Wind Report(1)	3/07/2020 4:16 PM
 9. PLN200037 - 25 Balmain Street & 128 - ...	23/11/2020 10:00 ...