



Vipac Engineers and Scientists Limited

279 Normanby Rd, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

Private Bag 16, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

t. +61 3 9647 9700 | f. +61 3 9646 4370 | e. melbourne@vipac.com.au

w. www.vipac.com.au | A.B.N. 33 005 453 627 | A.C.N. 005 453 627

City of Yarra
333 Bridge Road
Richmond, 3121,

6/08/2020

Ref: 30N-20-0144-GCO-6783560-0

Attention: Nish Goonetilleke

Dear Nish,

25 Balmain Street, 128 - 134 Cubitt Street & Laneway - Peer Review

This peer review of MEL Consultants "Desktop Environmental Wind Assessment" (Report: 47-20-DE-EWA-00 Rev1) is based on Vipac's experience as a wind engineer consultancy. No wind tunnel studies have been undertaken to support this review.

Vipac has reviewed the desktop Environmental Wind Assessment and the relevant drawings (refer to drawing list in attachment) and have the following comments:

- i. The MEL Consultants Environmental Wind Assessment has been prepared base on consultancy experience and no wind tunnel testing has been carried out to support their assessment. We have no issues with this method for a desktop study as this is a common approach to provide architects, developments and responsible authorities advice on the wind impact of the proposed design.
- ii. We have no issues with the analysis approach, wind environment and exposure estimate. MEL Consultants have clearly identified the process for the desktop assessment and this is consistent with the approach that Vipac would take. A clear description of the proposed development has provided along with the set of drawings provided by JCB Architects dated 18th June 2019.
- iii. The report has used the assessment criteria for Melbourne areas developed by MEL Consultants. Vipac has no issues with this, and believe that the criteria is in line and comparable with the council and DELWP guidelines.
- iv. The report analysed the wind effects of the four building facades on the streetscapes along Balmain Street, Cubitt Street and the small access road to the west. It concluded that the wind levels are expected to meet the recommended walking comfort criterion in the pedestrian pathways and stationary comfort criteria in the primary entrance and entries to the proposed tenancies. Vipac agrees with this conclusion.
- v. The report did not provide commentary on the expected wind conditions at the communal terraces proposed at various levels within the development. Vipac recommends that the MEL Consultants report be updated to include wind analysis and advice for the terraces, particularly the large communal terrace on Level 05.

In conclusion, the MEL Consultants Environment Wind Assessment report used the proper analysis and methodology to analyse the wind effects on the pedestrian level surrounding the proposed development in detail. The report found that the proposed design would be expected to have an acceptable wind environment within the recommended wind comfort criteria. However, it did not discuss the wind impacts to

6/08/2020

the communal terraces of the development. Vipac recommends that the Environmental Wind Assessment should be updated to address the wind conditions expected in these terraces.

Vipac agrees with the conclusion of no wind tunnel testing would be required for this development.

Yours sincerely,

Vipac Engineers & Scientists Ltd






Sophie Lamande
Wind Group Leader



Dr, Zhuyun Xu
Senior Wind Engineer

ATTACHMENT

Documents reviewed:

| Name | Date modified |
|---|-------------------|
|  Landscape Plans | 3/07/2020 4:16 PM |
|  Plans(2) | 3/07/2020 4:16 PM |
|  Wind Report(1) | 3/07/2020 4:16 PM |