

Station Street Proposed Trial Closure

For context – an extract of the Council report of 19 December 2017 setting out the detailed results of the public consultation undertaken in respect of Station Street at the intersection of Princes Street during October and November 2017 is provided below.

External Consultation

1. The consultation process and public notice thereof, was undertaken in line with Section 223 of the *Local Government Act* 1989 which requires that the public has at least 28 days' notice in which to provide a submission to Council on the proposal.
2. Consultation on the proposed temporary closure of Station Street was undertaken between 19 October 2017 and 22 November 2017.
3. A total of 2,744 letters were distributed by Council on 17 October 2017 to all properties and owner non-occupiers in the Carlton North Local Area Place Making area (LAPM 2).
4. This area is bounded by (and including) Park Street, Nicholson Street (west side of street), Princes Street (north side of street) and Lygon Street (east side of street).
5. The letter invited residents, property owners and business operators to provide a submission to Council on the proposal via either an online survey or a posted or emailed written submission.
6. The community were also advised of the public consultation process via a public notice in *The Leader* and the Council's Facebook page.
7. The invitation to present submissions, specifically requested respondents to indicate:
 - (a) Do they support / do not support a trial road closure?
 - (b) Some reasoning for their preference;
 - (c) If they supported a trial road closure, did they prefer a:
 - (i) 6 months trial;
 - (ii) 12 months trial; or
 - (iii) A different prescribed period of trial?

Individual Formal Submissions:

8. Overall, 136 individual responses were received for this consultation. These comprised:
 - (a) 101 responses from residents or owner non-occupiers in Carlton North;
 - (b) 17 responses from respondents who live outside of Carlton North but travel through the area by bicycle;
 - (c) 9 responses from respondents who live outside of Carlton North but work or have children attend school in Carlton North; and
 - (d) 9 responses from which the connection to Carlton North could not be identified from the response.

Consultation results – all respondents

9. Of **all** respondents:
 - (a) 31 (23%) support the temporary closure; and
 - (b) 105 (77%) oppose the temporary closure.
10. Responses to the preferred length of any temporary closure were:
 - (a) 6 months (26%);
 - (b) 12 months (18%); and
 - (c) No Answer (56%).
11. Of the 31 respondents **who support** the temporary road closure:
 - (a) 26 (84%) respondents live or own a property in Carlton North;
 - (b) 2 (7%) respondents live outside Carlton North, but commute or regularly travel through the area by bicycle;
 - (c) 1 (3%) respondent lives outside Carlton North, but either works or has children attend a school or child care in Carlton North; and
 - (d) 2 (6%) respondents from which the connection to Carlton North could not be identified from the submission.
12. Of those respondents **who supported** the temporary road closure, the stated preferred length of any temporary closure was:
 - (a) 6 months (19%);
 - (b) 12 months (74%); and
 - (c) No Answer (7%).
13. The key reasons given **for support** of the temporary road closure include:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
Concerns regarding the number of vehicles which use Station Street (36%)	Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to the level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85 th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr.
A temporary closure is required to see if there are any issues or not (21%)	Noted.
It will reduce rat running in Carlton North (16%)	Independent TIA identified through an origin and destination survey that most traffic using Station Street between Lee Street and Princes Street is locally generated.
There were no apparent issues during the Melbourne Water closure (14%)	Acknowledged. However, it is noted that there were multiple other significant road closures at this time which impacted on traffic flows in a number of streets in Carlton North and North Fitzroy. The benefits or impacts of a Station Street closure cannot properly be isolated from these other closures.
Support the temporary closure, but issues resulting from more traffic on other streets need to be addressed (11%)	There are no current proposals being considered outside of the temporary closure of Station Street. Such a response may indicate the desirability of an overall LAPM study to effectively consult and establish an overall impact of a closure.

It will have a positive impact for children walking to school (2%)	Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street, which are also key routes to schools. It is noted though the level of traffic on Station Street is low.
---	--

14. Of the 105 respondents **who oppose** the temporary road closure:
- (a) 75 (71%) respondents live or own a property in Carlton North;
 - (b) 15 (14%) respondents live outside Carlton North, but commute or regularly travel through the area by bicycle;
 - (c) 8 (8%) respondents live outside Carlton North, but either work or have children attend a school or child care in Carlton North; and
 - (d) 7 (7%) respondents where the connection to Carlton North could not be identified from submissions.
15. Of those respondents **who opposed** the temporary road closure, the stated preferred length of any temporary closure was:
- (a) 6 months (29%);
 - (b) 12 months (1%); and
 - (c) No Answer (70%).
16. The key reasons given for **opposition** to the temporary road closure:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
It will reduce the amenity of Canning Street as a cycle route / less safe for cyclists and pedestrians / school children on Canning Street (38%)	<p>Independent TIA states that increased traffic unlikely to have a significant impact on cyclists and pedestrians, although there is potential for occasional increased conflict between cyclists and vehicles at Canning / Davis intersection (cyclists) and vehicles / pedestrians at Canning / Princes intersection, with additional vehicles on Canning Street.</p> <p>Council's Strategic Transport Unit notes that additional vehicles on Canning Street will reduce the amenity of the cycle route in comparison to existing conditions.</p>
It will result in more vehicles and increased congestion on other streets in Carlton North (37%)	<p>Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant impacts on the operation of other roads in Carlton North.</p> <p>The proposal will likely transfer the current low level impacts on Station Street onto other streets.</p> <p>Whilst the number of potentially redistributed vehicles from Station Street onto other streets is low (i.e. one to two additional vehicles per minute), it could increase current AM peak hour flows on sections of Lee Street (136 westbound vehicles), Canning Street (75 southbound vehicles) and Davis Street (27 westbound vehicles) by 74%, 72% and 152% respectively in comparison to existing conditions noted above.</p> <p>The independent TIA also notes that it is expected that queuing on Canning Street back from Princes Street may occasionally extend to Davis Street, which at times, may impede the right turn movement from Canning Street into Davis Street.</p>

It has no wider benefit to Carlton North outside of the southern end of Station Street (12%)	Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street. It is noted though the level of traffic on Station Street is low.
It will result in longer travel times and inconvenience residents who require access to Princes Street (7%)	Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant traffic impacts on other roads in Carlton North. Vehicle travel times will be longer given extra travel distance and delays with crossing pedestrians at Canning / Princes intersection.
There is no existing traffic issue on Station Street in comparison to other streets in Carlton North (5%)	Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85 th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr. The number of vehicles using Station Street is lower than other north-south streets in the area, with the exception of Canning Street.
Proposal will not reduce traffic flows on Station Street to the north of Lee Street (1%)	Independent TIA notes that 58% of traffic that uses Station Street between Newry Street and Lee Street turns right into Lee Street, towards Canning Street. Proposal is unlikely to reduce the level of traffic using Station Street to the north of Lee Street.

Consultation results – Station Street residents

17. Of **Station Street** respondents, 14 (48%) support the temporary closure and 15 (52%) oppose the temporary closure.
18. The key reasons given by Station Street residents **who support** the temporary road closure include:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
Concerns regarding the number of vehicles which use Station Street (48%)	Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85 th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr.
There were no apparent issues during the Melbourne Water closure (14%)	Agreed. However, it is noted that there were multiple other road closures at this time which impacted on traffic flows in a number of streets in Carlton North and North Fitzroy. The benefits or impacts of a Station Street closure cannot properly be isolated from these other closures.
Support the temporary closure, but issues resulting from more traffic on other streets need to be addressed (14%)	There are no current proposals being considered outside of the temporary closure of Station Street. Such a response may indicate the desirability of an overall LAPM study to effectively consult and establish an overall impact of a closure.
A temporary closure is required to see if there are any issues or not (14%)	Noted.
It will reduce rat running in Carlton North (5%)	Independent TIA identified through an origin and destination survey that most traffic using Station Street between Lee Street and Princes Street is locally generated.

<p>It will have a positive impact for children walking to school (5%)</p>	<p>Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street, which are also key routes to schools.</p> <p>Also Independent TIA notes that currently, 58% of traffic that uses Station Street between Newry Street and Lee Street turns right into Lee Street, towards Canning Street. Proposal is unlikely to reduce the level of traffic using Station Street to the north of Lee Street.</p>
--	---

19. The key reasons given by Station Street residents **who oppose** the temporary road closure include:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
<p>It will result in more vehicles and increased congestion on other streets in Carlton North (26%)</p>	<p>Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant impacts on the operation of other roads in Carlton North.</p> <p>The proposal will likely transfer the current low level impacts on Station Street onto other streets.</p> <p>Whilst the number of potentially redistributed vehicles from Station Street onto other streets is low (i.e. one to two additional vehicles per minute), it could increase current AM peak hour flows on sections of Lee Street (136 westbound vehicles), Canning Street (75 southbound vehicles) and Davis Street (27 westbound vehicles) by 74%, 72% and 152% respectively in comparison to existing conditions noted above.</p> <p>Independent TIA also notes that it is expected that queuing on Canning Street back from Princes Street may occasionally extend to Davis Street, which at times, may impede the right turn movement from Canning Street into Davis Street.</p>
<p>It will reduce the amenity of Canning Street as a cycle route / less safe for cyclists and pedestrians/school children on Canning Street (26%)</p>	<p>Independent TIA states that increased traffic unlikely to have a significant impact on cyclists and pedestrians, although there is potential for occasional increased conflict between cyclists and vehicles at Canning/Davis intersection (cyclists) and vehicles/pedestrians at Canning/Princes intersection, with additional vehicles on Canning Street.</p> <p>Council's Strategic Transport Unit considers that additional vehicles on Canning Street will reduce the amenity of the cycle route in comparison to existing conditions.</p>
<p>It has no wider benefit to Carlton North outside of the southern end of Station Street (18%)</p>	<p>Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street. It is noted though the level of traffic on Station Street is low.</p>
<p>There is no existing traffic issue on Station Street in comparison to other streets in Carlton North (13%)</p>	<p>Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr.</p> <p>The number of vehicles using Station Street is lower than other north-south streets in the area, with the exception of Canning Street.</p>

It will result in longer travel times and inconvenience residents who require access to Princes Street (13%)	Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant traffic impacts on other roads in Carlton North. Vehicle travel times will be longer given extra travel distance and delays with crossing pedestrians at Canning/Princes intersection.
Proposal will not reduce traffic flows on Station Street to the north of Lee Street (5%)	Independent TIA notes that 58% of traffic that uses Station Street between Newry Street and Lee Street turns right into Lee Street, towards Canning Street. Proposal is unlikely to reduce the level of traffic using Station Street to the north of Lee Street.

Consultation results – respondents who live nearby on potentially impacted streets

20. The properties in the closest vicinity of Station Street / Princes Street are the streets where there is a higher likelihood of some traffic displacement with a Station Street closure in place.
21. This area is bound by Rathdowne Street (between Lee Street and Princes Street), Lee Street (between Rathdowne Street and Nicholson Street), Nicholson Street (between Lee Street and Princes Street) and Princes Street (between Rathdowne Street and Nicholson Street).
22. Of residents who live on these identified streets, 3 (13%) support the temporary closure and 20 (87%) oppose the temporary closure.
23. The key reasons given by these residents who **support** the temporary road closure include:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
Concerns regarding the number of vehicles which use Station Street (60%)	Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85 th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr.
There were no apparent issues during the Melbourne Water closure (20%)	Agreed. However, noted that there were multiple other road closures at this time which impacted on traffic flows in Carlton North and North Fitzroy. The benefits or impacts of Station Street closure cannot be isolated from these other closures.
It will have a positive impact for children walking to school (20%)	Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street, which are also key routes to schools. It is noted though the level of traffic on Station Street is low.

24. The key reasons given by these residents who **oppose** the temporary road closure include:

Respondent feedback comments	Officer comment
It will reduce the amenity of Canning Street as a cycle route / less safe for cyclists and pedestrians/school children on Canning Street (36%)	Independent TIA states that increased traffic unlikely to have a significant impact on cyclists and pedestrians, although there is potential for occasional increased conflict between cyclists and vehicles at Canning/Davis intersection (cyclists) and vehicles/pedestrians at Canning/Princes intersection, with additional vehicles on Canning Street. Council's Strategic Transport Unit considers that additional vehicles on Canning Street will reduce the amenity of the cycle route in comparison to existing conditions.
It will result in more vehicles and increased congestion on other streets in Carlton North (24%)	Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant impacts on the operation of other roads in Carlton North. The proposal will likely transfer the current low level impacts on Station Street onto other streets. Whilst the number of potentially redistributed vehicles from Station Street onto other streets is low (i.e. one to two additional vehicles per minute), it could increase current AM peak hour flows on sections of Lee Street (136 westbound vehicles), Canning Street (75 southbound vehicles) and Davis Street (27 westbound vehicles) by 74%, 72% and 152% respectively in comparison to existing conditions noted above. Independent TIA also notes that it is expected that queuing on Canning Street back from Princes Street may occasionally extend to Davis Street, which at times, may impede the right turn movement from Canning Street into Davis Street.
There is no existing traffic issue on Station Street in comparison to other streets in Carlton North (19%)	Independent TIA states that there is not an existing issue with regard to level and speed of traffic on Station Street, between Lee Street and Princes Street, with 1,000 (daily), 100 (AM peak) and 12 (PM peak) vehicles using this section of the street and a recorded 85 th percentile speed of 30.6km/hr. The number of vehicles using Station Street is lower than other north-south streets in the area, with the exception of Canning Street.
It has no wider benefit to Carlton North outside of the southern end of Station Street (15%)	Independent TIA identifies that the closure is unlikely to reduce vehicle movements in the area, rather redistribute existing vehicles onto Lee Street and Canning Street. It is noted though the level of traffic on Station Street is low.
It will result in longer travel times and inconvenience residents who require access to Princes Street (4%)	Independent TIA states that there is not expected to be any significant traffic impacts on other roads in Carlton North. Vehicle travel times will be longer given extra travel distance and delays with crossing pedestrians at Canning/Princes intersection.
Proposal will not reduce traffic flows on Station Street to the north of Lee Street (2%)	Independent TIA notes that 58% of traffic that uses Station Street between Newry Street and Lee Street turns right into Lee Street, towards Canning Street. Proposal is unlikely to reduce the level of traffic using Station Street to the north of Lee Street.

Summary of key findings

25. Overall, the majority of respondents 105 (77%) oppose the proposed temporary road closure. The opponents to the proposal are largely made up of Carlton North residents, but also include commuter cyclists and parents of children who attend schools in the area.
26. For Carlton North residents or property owners only, the majority of respondents 75 (74%) oppose the closure, whilst 26 (26%) support the closure.
27. Respondents **who support** the proposal consider that the temporary closure will assist with addressing traffic issues on Station Street and will reduce rat running, whilst some considered that there were no noticeable issues when the Melbourne Water temporary road closure was in place for 12 months.
28. Respondents **who oppose** the proposal generally consider there to be limited issues on Station Street and therefore consider the closure to be unnecessary as it would have limited wider benefit. These respondents are deeply concerned that the closure would impact negatively on access and safety given that traffic from Station Street will be transferred onto other streets. The safety and amenity of the key Canning Street cycling corridor is a key issue for these respondents.
29. Of all respondents, the stated preferred temporary closure length was 6 months.