

'INVESTING IN TRANSPORT' - REPORT COMMENTS

TABLE 1

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

Positive

- Nothing – maybe bicycle improvements are ok
- Increased buses in Johnston St are good, but there are concerns about traffic moving to Alexandra Parade
- The Doncaster bus is good if it cuts traffic in Yarra

Negative

- Buses are too polluting

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

Changes to Eddington Report

- It is not specific enough. Where will exhaust stacks and the entrances and exits to the road tunnel be located?
- Too indefinite on environmental issues e.g. exhaust fumes 'probably' move fumes away from residential
- Train – Clifton Hill express – is not looking at the existing service which could be improved, e.g. pick up more people
- Higher frequency of trains / buses / trams all day / "peak hour" service all day 24/7
- Greater frequencies needed at night so less waiting when returning home from city – theatre / festivals / cinema etc
- Road tunnel won't reduce the number of cars on the roads
- Congestion tax – one person cars pay more
- Hook turns where trams are turning so vehicles don't hold up public transport

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Tarneit rail link
- Improvement and development of Truck routes from Port of Melbourne
- Bicycle infrastructure – separate bike routes etc

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Rail link to Tullamarine airport
- Inner and outer circle rail line – may be buses instead
- Reduce petrol use – better / more public transport
- Single person cars need to be stopped
- Redesign cars with air conditioning
- Nothing to stop climate change
- Frequency of bus services that link to major public transport routes, rail stations, shopping strips etc.

TABLE 2

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

Recommendation 7

- Improving cross city cycle connections
- Need to encourage as much cycling across the city as possible
- Reduced road congestion but also relieves public transport congestion
- Major health benefits/increases work-life balance
- Being stuck in traffic frustrates people while healthy cycling relieves tension
- Cycling improvements
- Public transport improvements
- Park & Ride
- Rail tunnel / improved rail capacity
- Truck action plan
- Re-evaluate road toll policy
- Sustainable transport mode improvements
- Priority for buses/trams
- More freight by rail/better access by rail
- Better public transport prioritisation to Doncaster may reduce through-traffic
- All have contributed to generation of public debate on transport options for Melbourne
- Public Transport proposals
- Truck action plan – proposal to remove heavy freight vehicles from local roads
- Action to increase rail share of freight
- Cycling proposals
- Commonwealth (federal funding)
- Inadequate attention to East travel to West

Recommendation 7, 8, 9, 5

- Cycle links
 - Train/bus priorities
 - Park & Ride
 - Truck action plan
- I do not like any of the recommendations from the Eddington Report. I think the money spent for a tunnel would be better spent on extending the rail and tram routes to keep the cars out of the city as people would be able to use public transport and leave their cars at home or at the station, therefore there would be no need for a tunnel.

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

Recommendation 1

- The tunnel will not relieve traffic, just encourage more people to drive
- The tunnel will benefit shareholders only
- Eastlink finished 5 months ahead of schedule – shareholders benefit most from this increase
- Building roads simply encourages more vehicles on the roads
- Get rid of road tunnel
- More emphasis on walking / cycling planning
- Greater emphasis on rail freight, especially metro shuttles
- No road tunnel – more traffic / reliance on cars
- I believe we need to cease building freeways, rather improve the existing network where needed and totally prioritise public transport

- No Tunnel
- Rail to Doncaster and beyond to link to Ringwood, Melbourne University and City with bus as interim till rail built
- Rail patronage modelling weak: underestimated rail demand only looked at population of Doncaster, did not consider high speed rail
- Funding – not through surcharge on Council rates but levy on motor vehicle registration
- No review of 2020 – 20% PT by 2020 or 30% of freight by 2010 to and from ports, stick to and work to these targets
- Priority in funding to PT not roads
- No tunnel for Yarra. If there was better public transport from outlying suburbs there would be less cars on the road. It also means if the tunnel goes ahead people are going to lose their homes.

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

Recommendation 2 - Recommendation 10

- I agree with all recommendations that encourage public transport / cycling / walking.
- If unnecessary car trips could be taken away from the road / freeway, freight could use the extra road space.
- Doncaster Area Rapid Transport
- Rail improvements
- Cycling improvements
- If we had better public transport and people are encouraged to use it, then there would not be the numbers of cars in the city and inner suburb.

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

Recommendation 1

- Will not reduce traffic congestion.
- A cost benefit ratio of 1:4 is very low. Most bypass projects require a minimum of 2. I've worked on a bypass project with a C/B ratio of 8. \$9 billion investment should be spent on a higher C/B ratio project.
- More work needs to be done for public transport to poor outer areas
- Rail freight too little
- Better funding for public transport

Metro-Ride problems

- The report is based on flawed premises
- Underestimates public concern about climate change and that use of the private car is often because there are just no alternatives
- Tunnel will impact on Yarra yet not convinced it will solve N-S problem in Yarra

TABLE 3

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

Recommendation 4

- Road tunnel: toxic fumes from stacks; extra traffic; cost

Recommendation 6

- Buses instead of heavy rail to Doncaster
- Bus / rail at Victoria Park interchange, we think won't be used
- Council should get authoritative report on Doncaster options done favouring heavy rail

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

Recommendation 8

- Rail tunnel, although unsure that it is the best project or best use of the public transport dollar
- New rail line in western suburbs

Recommendation 3

- Expanding rail capacity

Recommendation 5

- Truck action plan – as long as no extra road space
- Cycling
- Public transport priority, as long as this does not mean clearway.
- Park & Ride (some support)
- Work with industry to move more freight by rail

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Road tunnel

TABLE 4

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- Increase bus service – Doncaster specific
- Good recommendation increasing public transport in/through the Manningham Corridor – Why? - Policy to get people out of cars
- Yarra: Recs 7, 8, 10, 11 – Yarra specific and agree “generally”

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

Recommendation 4

Do not like – Why? – Not addressing the major problem; congestion Hoddle / Eastern Freeway and Alexandra Parade

Recommendation 13

- Freight vehicles

Recommendation 19

- Tolls - if don't know which way it's going (displacing traffic “rat running”) would affect Yarra;
- Eddington – was not asked the right question i.e. traffic congestion rather than East-West
- The report does not address the problem of congestion, it aims to ease congestion
- There is a need for commuting into the city. This report does not address it (car drivers and parking in city area). Tunnel will not solve it.
- Not one mention of making buses and other forms of public transport accessible e.g. platforms to get on trams and buses
- Does not address issue of changing current mobility behaviour ie not making it easier for drivers
- Narrow scope of report e.g.: does not look at work practices that could be more environmentally sustainable; reducing commuting – life and services localised (local hubs)
- Does not address inadequate levels of public transport in Yarra.
- Truck, transport and freight emphasis of report – problematic – too narrow.

TABLE 5

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- Cycling projects
- Tolls reinforce expense / benefits of new roads
- Improved Doncaster bus

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Not east, west, south east, north, north west
- No real congestion relief
- Likelihood off-ramps will be built in Yarra
- Compulsory acquisition of some properties
- Vent stacks
- Rat-runs through Yarra avoiding tollways
- Seems to have been little public consultation prior to study (by Vic Govt – compared to Northern Central City Corridor Study)
- Question the value of bus / train interchange at Victoria Park
- Lack of genuine reference to NCCC
- No attempt to envisage / recommend reducing car use / increasing public transport load share

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Improved bus links – Doncaster
- More freight by rail
- New train tunnel – train / tram link
- Tarneit / Werribee rail link
- Public transport in west
- No exits to CBD but people will get off at Hoddle Street

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Presumption of continuous population growth – unsustainable
- Continued reliance on road travel
- Truck Action Plan - ? why not encourage them to use Citilink ramp (existing)

TABLE 6

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

Like

- Improvement Alexandra Parade: Why – bus routes, potential urban renewal
- Proposed bus route Johnston St, Victoria Parade – reduced congestion (if a dedicated bus route)

Change

- Don't like extra CO² fumes from exhaust pipes being pumped into Yarra (from the extra cars)
- Concerned about 'safety' of exhaust pipes
- No tunnel: Why? Does not make economic sense; noise pollution; air pollution
- 8km ring road – giving people option to use car or public transport

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Local Area Traffic Management (LATM) point of view – change Eddington Report so it works outwards from LATM point of view – and keep Yarra residential roads free from commuters taking shortcuts (rat runs).
- Entrance to Tunnel on Queens Parade – get rid of it: Why? Because it will turn Queens Parade into feeder road.
- Tunnel – creates only problems (congestion / air pollution) not benefits to Yarra

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Train Tunnel – less cars (environmental benefits and reduced congestion – giving people more opportunity to use PT)
- Increase in cycle paths: sustainable, efficient

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- No tunnel – rail instead – bring rail in from Doncaster – continue Alexander Avenue – joins Eddington rail tunnel – avoiding need to drive through Yarra.
- Bring rail out to airport
- More park and ride facilities
- Model Public Transport structure to that of European cities – who have proved potential capacity of train more efficient than cars
- Change priority of Eddington Report recommendations and include long-term sustainability in face of peak-oil, carbon pricing and air quality and Government targets. (that is, the Garnaut recommendations)
- Change recommendations to cater for poor in outer suburbs who will not be able to afford to travel by car with increasing petrol prices

TABLE 7

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- Buses – Johnston Street to University
- Cycle path investment, particularly where separated from cars
- Bus and tram priority at intersections

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Vision wrong: Peak oil, climate change, growth as per “normal”, therefore end result flawed.

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Join up freeways: Disagreement whether it will resolve or worsen things.
- Support rail tunnel
- Melbourne 2030 – good plan: invest in making it work

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Take climate change into proper account, i.e. not business as usual
- Improve City Loop capacity – e.g. driver changeover
- Decentralise: Investment in research / “green” technology; Investment in cycling / public transport etc not roads

TABLE 8

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- No off-ramps – ok if stuck to
- Improving reserves
- Bike lanes on John Street
- Improve N-S flow of trams
- Buses: Cheaper – more access
- Hub at Vic Park – allows movement in all directions
- Decreased traffic on Alexandra Parade
- Train to University and bike lanes

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Lack of detail in Yarra
- Vents location (Royal Park)
- Housing demolition
- Buses - Carbon emissions
- Disruption and damage during construction eg house cracking and no compensation
- Traffic being diverted during construction to local streets to avoid tolls
- Possible blocking of streets to force cars into / onto tunnel
- Resale value of private property impacted
- Tolling of currently free roads
- Possible less business for local traders in Johnston Street
- Freeways encourages car culture
- Heritage listed properties / can they be altered or demolished
- No late input or changes without public approval
- Lack of detail

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Metro style underground rail tunnel
- Footscray to Caulfield rail should be good (whether freight comes off at Caulfield or not)
- Road from Port to West makes sense

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Lack of environmental understanding
- Lack of congestion charge proposal
- Lack of rail web (compared with London)
- No train line extension for years
- Not happy if tunnel linked to Westgate
- Does not shift usage to public transport (same paradigm)
- None of the planning for the road tunnel leaves room for increase of usage in future (eg train in tunnel)
- Wrong assumption the car will remain earthbound and unevolved forever

TABLE 9

NO ROAD TUNNEL

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- Agree with more priority for trams and buses including bus lanes on Johnston St
- Would like to see Alexandra Parade more pedestrian friendly – would be good if this happened
- If this reduced local traffic jams then it is to be supported
- Support 7 – cycle links
- Support for Park & Ride (not Yarra)
- Look at what Council can do to promote public transport

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Do not believe there will be no off-ramps
- Disagree with philosophy that we need to build more roads
- Support decentralised city eg hubs
- Do not support hubs
- Social impact of road tunnel – creates a carved up City
- Do not support assumptions that there must be growth
- No more Public Private Partnerships
- Lack of planning all round will simply lead to more congestion
- Need to recognise the impact of personal behaviour
- Dig up the freeways and find new ways to use the land. Do not build more.

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

TABLE 10

Question 1

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra do you like and why?

- Focus on moving people and things less
- Focus on mobility
- Change assumptions in model i.e. petrol prices – release information
- Assumptions guarantee results (?)
- Walking and cycling – not travelling across City of Yarra
- Access to entry points

Question 2

What recommendations directly affecting the City of Yarra would you change and why?

- Park & Ride is a joke
- Road Tunnel
- No consideration to public bicycle system as intended i.e. European cities
- Access to entry points and more public transport
- Proper networking of public transport

Question 3

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area do you like and why?

- Bus lanes
- Increasing cycling routes

Question 4

What recommendations affecting the wider Melbourne metropolitan area would you change and why?

- Rail tunnel

Additional note – not sure what table

The Tunnel, Freeways and “Melbourne 2030”

For an alternative view from a common-sense and engineering perspective –

<http://barryeduff.bigblog.com.au>