

MEMORANDUM

TO Danny Hahey, Associate, Contour Consultants FROM Peter Lovell

RE Response to City of Yarra Heritage Advice, 46-74 Stanley Street, 23-35 Napoleon Street Collingwood DATE 13 February 2012

This memorandum has been prepared for Contour Consultants on behalf of Urban Inc. the owner of 46-74 Stanley Street, 23-35 Napoleon Street Collingwood. A Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) was prepared by Lovell Chen in September 2011 and lodged with a town planning permit application (PLN11/0591) to the City of Yarra for a redevelopment of the site for residential purposes.

The memorandum responds to matters raised in the heritage advice prepared for the City of Yarra by Anthemion Consultants dated 16 January 2012, in relation to the proposed works. The heritage advice questions the relationship between the proposed development and the Foy & Gibson buildings, particularly the north end of Cambridge Street where the proposed development is considered to dominate the immediate context. To counteract against this, the advice recommends the removal of the top (ninth) level from the central of three residential towers, the tower which effectively closes the view north along Cambridge Street.

Comment

The Foy & Gibson complex of factory buildings has a large footprint, spreading across four street blocks, from Little Oxford Street (west) to Wellington Street (east). The complex supports buildings of various heights, linked by both the materiality of their construction – generally red face brick and render – and their building form – constructed to the street line with no setbacks. Historically, the development of the Foy & Gibson factory complex has concentrated the elements of greatest height to the Oxford and Little Oxford Street streetscapes, at the higher end of the ‘Collingwood Slope Heritage Overlay Precinct’ (HO318). This has had the effect of advantageously locating some of these taller buildings and elements – in this case the former Foy & Gibson Whiteworks Building and the Boiler House chimneys – on corner sites ‘bookending’ Oxford Street where they remain the dominant elements in the heritage overlay precinct, and particularly so in relation to the Stanley Street boundary.

There are other Foy & Gibson factory buildings with similarly large footprints, but of a significantly lower building height, which line Cambridge Street in the immediate vicinity of the subject site. The contrast between the heights of those buildings which line Oxford Street and those which line Cambridge Street at the Stanley Street (north end) of these streetscapes is marked. The subject site is located at an distance from those buildings of the Foy & Gibson factory complex which are of a comparable scale, and it is our assessment that preparing additional material documenting the contrast between the height of the proposed development and the Foy & Gibson buildings opposite is unnecessary. The proposed new buildings are clearly at a scale which contrasts with that of the lower-height buildings opposite but as addressed in the Heritage Impact Statement we consider this is an acceptable outcome from a heritage perspective. The scale of the proposed buildings accords broadly with that of the adjoining contemporary buildings to the north side of Stanley Street, and as such is of a form anticipated for the *Mixed Use – Otter Precinct* in which the site is located in accordance with the *Smith Street Structure Plan*. The proposed development’s podium height also accords with the height of its immediate

neighbour and the height and form assist with the management of the transition of scale between the proposed development and the lower-scale Foy & Gibson buildings which frame the entry to Cambridge Street. Appropriately, the three tower forms are also set back from the street edge and adopt a staggered profile, which makes reference to the heritage character of the Foy & Gibson factory complex, notably the Oxford Street streetscape, as outlined in our Heritage Impact Statement of September 2011, pp. 13-14.

The removal of the uppermost storey of the central residential tower will make no appreciable difference to the impact of the proposed development on Stanley Street and Cambridge Street or its wider surroundings. The subject site is considered to be located at a reasonable distance from the elements of the Foy & Gibson factory complex of comparable height, with which it could be considered to contrast or compete. It is our unchanged view that the proposed redevelopment of 46-74 Stanley Street is both an appropriate response to the adjoining heritage overlay precinct and specifically the Foy & Gibson factory complex, as well as to the guidelines for new development of the *Smith Street Structure Plan*.